I Is homogenisation of Australian temperature data any good?

2

3 Part 3. Meekatharra, Western Australia

- 4
- 5 Dr Bill Johnston¹

6 <u>scientist@bomwatch.com.au</u>

7

The ACORN-SAT project is deeply flawed, unscientific and should be abandoned. Read on ...

8 Summary

- 9 Homogenised data for 112 Australian Climate Observations Reference Network Surface Air
- 10 Temperature (ACORN-SAT) sites are used by the Bureau of Meteorology, CSIRO, state
- 11 governments, WWF, the Climate Council, to convince themselves, kiddies for climate action, and
- 12 everyone else that the climate is warming irrevocably due to CO₂. However, that is not the case at
- 13 Meekatharra, Western Australia, where dodgy measurement practices and data homogenisation
- 14 are used to create warming in maximum temperature (Tmax) data that is unrelated to the climate.
- 15 Joining disparate datasets to form long series is fraught with uncertainty. The condition of
- 16 instruments, their protection from direct and indirect heat, and local effects such as watering,
- 17 shade etc., together with diligence in taking and reporting observations all impact on trend and
- 18 change. The most insidious way to cheat is to adjust for changes that made no difference,
- 19 selectively ignore some that did, and use faulty data from inter-correlated neighbouring sites to
- 20 adjust faults in ACORN-SAT.
- 21 While the 12m by 5.4m carrier equipment building constructed on the eastern side of the
- 22 Meekatharra post office yard in 1946 was bound to affect temperatures measured there since
- 23 1927, the effect of moving to the aerodrome in 1950, and to the meteorological office (MO) in the
- 24 1970s is less certain. BomWatch protocols were used to verify that homogenisation methods used
- 25 by Bureau of Meteorology scientist Blair Trewin, who developed ACORN-SAT, were sound.
- Adjusting for a change in 1934 that was not significant, ignoring that the Aeradio site was watered, and that a period of overlap from 1972 was used to smooth the move to the MO site, allegedly in *about* 1975, for which no adjustment was made, created trends in homogenised data that were unrelated to the climate. Furthermore, data for the total of 18 sites used to homogenise
- 30 Meekatharra Tmax, were not homogeneous.
- 31 Trewin's assumption that comparator sites selected on the basis of inter-site correlations would
- 32 be broadly homogeneous around the time site changes occurred, and therefore that comparator
- 33 series derived from multiple reference stations could provide a *"high level of robustness against*"
- 34 *undetected inhomogeneities"* is demonstrably not true. As there is no change in the climate across
- 35 all the datasets examined, and faulty data are routinely used to adjust faults in ACORN-SAT, the
- 36 ACORN-SAT project is deeply flawed, unscientific and should be abandoned.

¹ Former NSW Department of Natural Resources research scientist and weather observer.

37 **1. Introduction**

Maximum temperature time-series consist of an ambient background signal, which is assumed to be constant; variation due to rainfall, which is the causal or deterministic covariable, and unexplained residual variation reflecting the weather the wider climate. Disaggregating the total signal into component parts is the key to determining climatic trend and change.

Read on ...

38 Files held by the National Archives of Australia (NAA) show a site for the post office at

- 39 Meekatharra was acquired in 1901 and a post office commenced operating in a 'non-official'
- 40 capacity in 1906. A 1939 photograph shows a substantial building on the corner of Main Street
- 41 (the Great Northern Highway) and High Street that included a 4-bedroom postmaster's residence
- 42 (Figure 1). The yard behind was occupied by a lavatory, wash-house, and a 12m by 5.4 (5.5 m to
- 43 the ridge) carrier equipment building adjacent to the eastern boundary, which housed a
- 44 generator, battery-room, workshop and switching gear that was planned in March 1945 and built
- 45 (together with a new lavatory) before 1950. A line-yard and linesman's workshop (office, store-
- 46 rooms etc.) was located on a separate title behind the post office, which in the 1970s became the
- 47 site of a microwave tower and automatic telephone exchange.



Figure 1. The Meekatharra post office and residence in 1939 (NAA photograph).

In 1943 the WW-II Air Board approved construction of a jointly funded Royal Australian Air Force (RAAF)/United States Army Air Force (USAAF) aerodrome about 5 km SE of Meekatharra on the inland transport route between Perth, the secret bomber base at Corunna Downs near Marble Bar, and Darwin (Figure 2).

Figure 2. RAAF Avro Anson A4-38 at the original Meekatharra landing ground on 25 June 1938 during an inspection tour of potential aerodrome sites (National Library of Australia photograph). Although flat, featureless and wind-blown, the landing ground close to town was not selected as the site for the new RAAF/USAAF aerodrome.

71 Planned as part of a defensive perimeter, specifications called for all-weather runways capable of

Ś

- handling fighter aircraft and heavy bombers. However, due to its isolation, the cost of sealing the
- 4960-foot S-W and the 7157-foot E-W runways (1500m and 2200m) increased from £43,498 to
- 54 £80,000. The 'bare base' aerodrome was ready for use by January 1944. An aerial photograph
- taken near the end of the dry season on 11 September 1949 and a 1952 aerodrome survey
- showed the location of the Aeradio office, a path leading to the meteorological enclosure, a
- 77 hydrogen hut and theodolite stand used for tracking weather balloons; the powerhouse,
- 78 meteorological/seismograph hut, caretaker's cottage, terminal etc. (Figure 3). Notably, the

- photograph shows a substantial area covering the earth-mat that grounded the radio antenna
- 80 array was watered, probably to improve electrical connectivity with the dry soil.
- 81 Although not a busy aerodrome, Meekatharra also served as an alternative landing ground in case
- 82 those around Perth became unserviceable due to inclement conditions. It was relinquished by the
- 83 RAAF to the Department of Civil Aviation (DCA) after the War, and in 1993 ownership transferred
- 84 to the Shire of Meekatharra.



- 85 Figure 3. An aerial photograph of the Meekatharra aerodrome dated 11 September 1949 (National
- 86 Library of Australia) and an expanded view of the operational precinct (right) showing workshop
- (ws), equipment store (eq), power station (ps), windsock (wsk), Royal Flying Doctor Service
 hanger (Rfds), terminal (T), and the underground power line (pwr) to the distance measuring
- hanger (Rfds), terminal (T), and the underground power line (pwr) to the distance measuring
 equipment (DME) and caretaker's residence, outside the frame. The Aeradio office (Ar) is nearby
- equipment (DME) and caretaker's residence, outside the frame. The Aeradio office (Ar) is nearby
 an area that was watered (w) probably to improve performance of the buried earth-mat that
- 91 grounded the **70**-foot high (**21** m) radio aerials. "X" marks the position of the meteorological
- 92 enclosure.
- 93 Situated at the end of the railway from Geraldton, Meekatharra was chosen as a high-priority
- 94 RAAF base because it could be rapidly re-supplied. Famously referred to as the end of the earth by
- 95 Australia's former Prime Minister, Malcolm Fraser when his aircraft was diverted from Perth to
- 96 Meekatharra in 1977 due to inclement weather, Meekatharra is now the epicentre of a mining
- 97 boom in Western Australia and the airport serves as a hub for its fly-in fly-out workforce and a
- 98 base for the Royal Flying Doctor Service (RFDS).
- 99 Monthly average temperature and rainfall for Peak Hill (BoM ID 7070), a mining settlement about 100 110 km NW of Meekatharra is available from the Bureau of Meteorology (BoM) from 1898 and in
- 100 110 km NVV of Meekatharra is available from the Bureau of Meteorology (Bolvi) from 1898 and if
- deriving the initial 1993¹ homogenised High-Quality dataset (HQ₁), Simon Torok abutted Peak Hill
 and Meekatharra post office data to create a longer series. In his 1996 PhD thesis² Torok noted
- 103 that the Peak Hill site "moved 65 miles to new PO (at Meekatharra, site ID 7046) for better
- 104 observers" in January 1926, and that the Stevenson screen was in poor condition. Also, that in
- 105 June 1944 the screen was a "*bit high*" and that in January 1946 building works (the carrier
- 106 equipment building and lavatory) had occurred in the post office yard.
- 107 According to site-summary metadata, weather observations by RAAF Aeradio staff commenced at
- 108 the aerodrome in 1944, five years before observations transferred from the post office allegedly
- 109 on 25 April 1950. However, only sporadic daily rainfall data from 1944 is available from the BoM.

¹ Torok, S.J. and Nicholls, N. (1996). A historical annual temperature dataset for Australia. Aust. Met. Mag., 45, 251-260.

² Torok SJ (1996). Appendix A1, in: "The development of a high-quality historical temperature data base for Australia". PhD Thesis, School of Earth Sciences, Faculty of Science, The University of Melbourne.

4

- 110 Aeradio staff re-deployed from the RAAF in June 1946 to either DCA Flight Services (radio) and the
- BoM (meteorology), and plans held by the NAA show the office was upgraded to accommodate
- additional staff and an Officer-in-Charge in 1955. The meteorological enclosure, which included a
- hydrogen shed, Stevenson screen and theodolite stand was 37m southwest of the office (Figure 4).
- (Accurate survey of coordinates and height of the theodolite stand was essential for calculating wind-speed, direction, and altitude of manually tracked weather balloons relative to the datum,
- 116 which was mean sea level at Geraldton.)
- 117 While BoM site-summary metadata gives coordinates of the 1944 site as Latitude -26.6108°,
- Longitude 118.5444°, which places it on the northern side near the current terminal, aerodrome
- plans and the 1939 aerial photograph cross-referenced by Google Earth Pro show it was located
- 120 on the southern side at about Latitude -26.6111°, Longitude 118.5447°. Satellite images show the
- 121 1500m S-W runway was closed, two 1,000 gallon (3,700 litre) WW-II fuel tanks buried under the
- 122 RFDS-hanger apron were removed and the Aeradio office was demolished before March 2003.





Figure 4. An undated Civil Aviation Historical Society & Airways Museum photograph showing the post-1955 Meekatharra Aeradio office viewed from the south (the taxiway is on the right) adjacent to the apex of three 70' (21m) high aerial towers; and below, a sketch plan from NAA dated 4 June 1950 showing the fenced meteorological enclosure containing the hydrogen hut, theodolite stand and the Stevenson screen about 37m SW of the office.

An aerial photograph taken on 2 April 1981 shows that with the exception of the RFDS hanger (which had been replaced), most of the WW-II buildings had been demolished and a new terminal and control centre was established adjacent to the long E-W runway on the western side and a new meteorological office (MO) was located adjacent to the airport entrance. An NAA search of the term "Meekatharra meteorological" revealed the BoM owned four houses in Meekatharra. Other holdings included an equipment file (1964 to 1983), files relating to construction of the new MO (1971 to 1975); archived weather reports (1971 to 1983), and various administration files.

155 Critical to understanding changes in the data, file-titles also show that a new meteorological156 enclosure, met-hut, instruments, theodolite stand and windshield used to assist launching

- weather balloons were installed at the new MO site in 1972. However, most items are in Perth and
 few are open for inspection. As the new office probably had not been completed by 1972, there
- 159 can be little doubt that parallel temperature observations at both the previous and the new site
- 160 were used to smooth the transition, and this occurred possibly until 1974. (Although plans had
- 161 been made for a new building in 1972, the contract was apparently not awarded until 1973).
- 162 Previously an HQ site¹, Meekatharra is one of 112 Australian Climate Observations Reference
- 163 Network Surface Air Temperature (ACORN-SAT) sites² used by BoM and CSIRO to monitor
- Australia's warming. Twenty-five of those sites are in WA (Figure 5). It is therefore important to
- 165 verify that data are sound (daily observations were precise and consistently observed), that
- 166 metadata (data about the data) is accurate, and that adjustments made to account for site and 167 instrument changes are robust (replicable). Replicate analysis of the same data using objective
- 168 statistical methods underpins the scientific method and provides assurance that methods used by
- 169 BoM scientists to homogenise data are unbiased by *a priori* narratives.



Figure 5. Meekatharra is one of 25 ACORN-SAT sites in Western Australia (red circles). Grey circles show weather stations having >10-years of maximum temperature data are mostly concentrated in the southwest agricultural region.

ACORN-SAT metadata states that the current site is located at the Meteorological Office on the western side of the airport over bare red soil with patchy low grass. The Catalogue shows a photograph of the office (dated 7 August 2010) but not the site. It says, the site began operating in 1950 with no significant overlap with the post office, and that <u>it moved 1.1 km *east* in *about 1975</u>. However, originally on the eastern side of the airport, the site probably moved due <i>west*. Also, as the MO site operated from 1973, 1975 probably marked when the old site closed. Distance and direction provided by ACORN-SAT is also inconsistent with site-summary metadata.</u>

- 186 A Milos automatic weather station (AWS) installed on 7 February 1991 became the primary
- 187 instrument on 1 November 1996 and following a period of overlap from 1998, the Milos was
- replaced by an Almos AWS in 2001. A 60-litre Stevenson screen replaced the former standard
- 189 230-litre Screen on 2 May 1996³, which was during the time the Milos AWS was operating but
- 190 before the AWS became the primary instrument. While the AWS and the Stevenson screen
- 191 changed, ACORN-SAT metadata stated there were no documented moves at the MO site.
- 192 This report aims to verify that trends and changes in maximum temperature (Tmax), and
- 193 temperature extremes at Meekatharra are similar to those reported by Bureau of Meteorology
- (BoM) scientist Blair Trewin, who following the earlier HQ update by Della-Marta et al. (2004)
- 195 developed ACORN-SAT.

The question is whether Trewin's homogenisation methods are unbiased and that trends in homogenised data truly reflect the climate.

² Trewin, Blair (2012). A daily homogenized temperature data set for Australia. Int. J. Climatol. 33, 1510-29 DOI: 10.1002/joc.3530

 ¹ Della-Marta, P., Collins, D. and Braganza, K. (2004). Updating Australia's high quality annual temperature dataset. *Aust. Met. Mag.* 53, 15-19 <u>https://www.cmar.csiro.au/e-print/internal/braganza_x2004a.pdf</u>

³ Table 5 in: The Australian Climate Observations Reference Network – Surface Air Temperature (ACORN-SAT): Observation practices. (Bureau of Meteorology 2012). (40 pp)

198 **2. Methods**

Methods of analysing temperature data should be physically based, objective, replicable and not able to be influenced by *a priori* narratives.

Read on ...

199 Daily temperature data for the post office and airport, and monthly rainfall data were downloaded 200 from BoM's Climate Data Online facility. Temperature data were merged as per ACORN-SAT and

from BoM's Climate Data Online facility. Temperature data were merged as per ACORN-SAT and annual averages and other attributes were summarised into an Excel compatible csv-format using

the statistical package R (v4.1.2)¹. (Monthly HQ data had been archived previously). Statistical

analysis was undertaken using the *Rcmder*² and *emmeans* packages³ as outlined for Parafield⁴ and

204 Marble Bar⁵. Step-change analysis was undertaken using STARS (Sequential Three-step Analysis of

- Regime Shifts⁶). Raw data and packages are in the public domain, and a downloadable Excel workbook containing data used in the study is available from <u>www.bomwatch.com.au</u>
- 207 Daily rainfall, Tmax, Tmin, and estimated pan evaporation from 1900 were also downloaded for
- 208 the Latitude Longitude cell encompassing Meekatharra (-26.60, 118.55) from SILO
- 209 (https://www.longpaddock.qld.gov.au/silo/) and summarised using R into a year by month csv-
- 210 format dataset. As SILO data are interpolated, they may better represent the general climate.

3. Results

3.1 The general climate

Inland from the ocean and surrounded by desert, the climate of Meekatharra is dry, hot and generally inhospitable.

Read on ...

- 213 First settled as a mining camp in 1896, Meekatharra lies 500 km east from Shark Bay in central
- 214 Western Australia south of the Gibson Desert and west of the Great Victoria Desert. Average Tmax
- ranges from 38.2°C in January to 19.3°C in July, and minima from 23.8°C in January to 7.1°C in June
- 216 (Figure 6).
- 217 While annual rainfall is less than Marble Bar (225 vs. 363mm/yr), rainfall data are highly skewed 218 (long-tailed) with 32% of years contributing over 50% of the total rainfall since 1900. The driest



year was 1944 (44.4mm), the wettest was 2000 (525.5mm), and 8% of years received <100mm/yr.

Figure 6. Average monthly maximum and minimum temperatures at Meekatharra (SILO data).

Rainfall is low in all months, particularly after August, and as monthly evaporation exceeds rainfall by a factor >2 there is zero likelihood of a

sustained positive soil moisture balance. Furthermore, rainfall occurs in episodes: years that are

relatively dry interspersed by years that are relatively rainy, which are unpredictable in timing and duration. Rainfall was generally low from 1934 to 1960 (Figure 7).

¹ R Core Team (2022). <u>https://www.R-project.org/</u>.

² https://socialsciences.mcmaster.ca/jfox/Misc/Rcmdr/

³ https://www.rdocumentation.org/packages/emmeans/versions/1.8.2

⁴ <u>https://www.bomwatch.com.au/data-quality/part-1-methods-case-study-parafield-south-australia-2/</u>

⁵ <u>https://www.bomwatch.com.au/data-quality/part-2-marble-bar-the-warmest-place-in-australia-2/</u>

⁶ <u>https://sites.google.com/view/regime-shift-test</u>



229 Figure 7. Average and percentile monthly rainfall distributions and potential evaporation (left) and

230 rainfall episodicity as indicated by cumulative sums of differences from the long term monthly grand

231 mean (CuSum). The period from April 1934 to about 1960 was cumulatively dry (the CuSum declined),

232 near-average conditions prevailed from 1960 to November 1981 (the curve showed no consistent trend),

233 and from 1981 to March 2000 the climate was relatively moist (the curve ascends). Dry conditions again 234 prevailed from March 2017 (summarised from SILO data).

235 1.1 Partitioning climate and site change effects

Partitioning variation due to rainfall from discontinuities caused by site changes is the key to understanding climate-related trend and change.

Read on ...

- 236 Tmax depends on rainfall and consistent with the First Law of Thermodynamics, dry years are 237 warm and the drier it is the warmer it gets. Evaporation of rainfall removes latent heat from the
- 238 environment by convection, which is locally cooling, while the remaining portion of the heat
- 239 balance warms the air in contact with the ground by advection, and is measured during the heat of
- 240 the day by maximum thermometers housed in Stevenson screens.
- Tmax data were examined from two perspectives: 241
- 242 1. Consistent with the First Law Theorem, average Tmax is *expected* to be linearly, inversely 243 related to rainfall. Statistical significance (P) and goodness of fit (R²_{adj}) objectively describe 244 robustness of the relationship and should rainfall fully explain Tmax, rainfall-domain 245 residuals would be independent, normally distributed with equal variance across their 246 range. Lack of significance evidences a problem with the data, which could be from 247 somewhere else for instance, or other factors such as watering or problems with 248 observers, screens or instruments may nullify the signal.
- 249 2. Linear regression also partitions variation due to rainfall from residual variation caused by 250 non-rainfall effects. Analysed as time-series, persistent step-changes in residuals (re-scaled 251 for convenience by adding grand-mean Tmax), identify background changes that have 252 occurred in parallel with observations. Objective analysis requires that changes in data are 253 detected using independent statistical methods; and that where possible, they cross-254 reference to what is known about the site *post hoc* (i.e., that analysis is informed by the 255 data not vice versa).
- 256 The relationship between Tmax and rainfall at Meekatharra was highly significant (P < 0.001);
- rainfall reduced Tmax by 0.055°C/100mm and explained 38.8% of Tmax variation (R²_{adi} = 0.387) 257
- 258 (Figure 8(a)). Step-changes in raw Tmax detected in 1946, 1976, 1984 and 1998 (Figure 8(b)) are
- 259 potentially confounded with rainfall, which is deterministic on Tmax. Therefore, their timing could
- 260 be related to persistent changes in the weather, not changes in the post office yard, or at the

airport where the site moved in the 1970s, a 60-litre Stevenson screen was installed in May 1996

and AWS instruments changed in 1998.



Figure 8. Step-changes in raw Tmax (b) and rescaled Tmax residuals ((c) to (e)) detected by STARS. Sequential differences in means were highly significant (P < 0.01). Numbers of daily observations <355/yr are indicated by red squares.

While a range of STARS settings consistently detected step-changes 1946 and 1996, the move to the MO, allegedly in *about* 1975 could not be confidently resolved. The various homogenisation iterations, including by Torok and Nicholls (1996)¹ ignored that the site moved in the 1970s. However, being the time-series mid-point, change at that time could critically affect overall trend.

As some step-changes were positive and others negative, segments were compared to identify

those with statistically similar means (identified Figure 6 (b) to (e) by the same subscript). Un-

280 grouped and grouped data were analysed separately as scenarios. In addition, a changepoint was

inserted in 1975, and a final scenario deleted the 1970s changepoint altogether. Aerial photograph

and satellite image overlays confirmed that the site at the MO had remained in the same place

since at least 1981 (Figure 9).



Figure 9. An overlaid re-scaled portion of the 1981 aerial photograph (opacity 0.75) shows the MO site immediately below the point marked 'X' was in the same place as it was in recent Google Earth Pro satelite images.

The scenario that best describes the data is that with the highest R²_{adj} and the smallest Akaike information criterion (AIC). (The AIC is *an estimator of prediction error and thereby* <u>relative quality</u> of statistical models for a given set of data².) Use of objective methods and criteria provides confidence that changepoints were not applied arbitrarily. Analysis of the scenario depicting changepoints in 1946, the forced changepoint in 1975, and that in 1996 (Appendix 1, Case 6) is shown in Figure 10.

¹ Torok, S.J. and Nicholls, N. (1996). A historical annual temperature dataset for Australia. Aust. Met. Mag., 45, 251-260.

² <u>https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Akaike information criterion</u>



Figure 10. The analysis sequence for Appendix 1, Case 6 (forced step-change in 1975). While the linear regression relationship in (a) is highly significant (P > 0.001) and rainfall reduces Tmax 0.054°C/100mm, as rainfall only explains 38.8% of Tmax variation naïve analysis may have failed to account for another variable. In addition to the 1975 changepoint that was forced onto the data, STARS detected step-changes in rescaled residuals (data minus the regression equation, rescaled by the grand-mean) in 1946 and 1996. Tested using one-way analysis of variance and pairwise comparisons, means for segments 1927 to 1945 and 1975 to 1995 were the same and were therefore re-evaluated as a single category in (c). Free-fit relationships relative to dataset averages are shown for segment-groups in (c) to (e).

321 Categorical multiple linear regression (MLR) of the pooled dataset (Figure 10(f)) verifies that

322 segmented responses to rainfall were the same (segmented regressions were parallel), that 323 rainfall-adjusted segment means were different (segmented relationships were offset), and that

324 pooled relationships were statistically significant, with scenarios and rainfall explaining >50% of

Tmax variation (in this case R^2_{adj} =0.706). Furthermore, MLR residuals were found to be

independent, normally distributed with equal variance across categories, indicating all factors are

327 accounted-for and analysis is complete. Importantly, as no trend or other systematic signals were

328 detected in MLR residuals there is no evidence that the climate has changed or warmed. *Post hoc*

analysis found data for 2019, allegedly the hottest year on record, was over-range by 1.24°C

compared to the value predicted for that year ($31.86^{\circ}C \text{ vs } 30.62^{\circ}C \pm 1.01^{\circ}C_{Pl}$), and was therefore

331 likely to be an artefact.

Files held by the NAA show that in anticipation of building the new met-office (which was probably not completed until 1974), a new site was established there in 1972 and that a period of overlap

334 with the previous site was used to smooth the eventual transition. However, while inferred by the

- titles of BoM's files, the move could not be confidently confirmed by available site-summary and
- 336 ACORN-DAT metadata. Further, as the MO is on the western side of the airport, it could not have
- 337 moved <u>east</u> in about 1975 as claimed by ACORN-SAT. Also, unless the Aeradio office was
- disbanded beforehand, it could not have been in the vicinity of the current terminal either. While
- ignoring a changepoint in the 1970s gives a much inferior fit, the Akaike information criterion
- 340 suggests Scenario 3 (a step-change in 1972), which aligned both with metrication and
- 341 establishment of the new site, to be the most likely candidate (Appendix 1).

342 As the change in 1972 is a critical determinant of overall trend (especially if expressed as

343 anomalies relative to 30-year averages calculated between 1961 to 1990), in-depth investigation

of data, supported by *post hoc* attribution and cross-referencing of all available sources of

345 information, vindicates the methodology used by BomWatch to evaluate the maximum

346 temperature time-series.

347 **1.2 Precision of daily observations**

Daily data are assumed to be consistently precise, which is often not the case.

Read on ...

348 The precision with which daily data are reported is indexed by the frequency of decimal fractions

- and for data observed consistently to one decimal place, each decimal fraction (x.0, x.1, ... x.9))
- would represent 10% of the total number of fractions/year, and their average would be 0.45 $((\Sigma x.0 + x.1 + .. x.9)/10)$.
- 352 However, Monte Carlo simulations show that because the second decimal place was not
- 353 preserved when Fahrenheit data entered the Bureau's database, whole-degrees Fahrenheit
- 354 converted to Celsius, back-transform from the database (i.e., from °C to °F) in the ratio of about
- 355 55% x.0 and 22% each of x.9 and x.1. Also, data observed in whole and ½°F, back-transform from
- ³⁵⁶ °C to °F in the ratios of about 30% x.0, 9% to 11% x..9 and x.1; and, about 26%, x.5 and 10% x.4 and 357 x.6. (If stored to 2-decimal places, °F-data would back-transform to their original value.) To be
- x.6. (If stored to 2-decimal places, °F-data would back-transform to their original value.) To be
 clear, precision is an index of accuracy, training and diligence, which may or may not impact on
- 359 long-term Tmax trend. However, observations consistently rounded up or down to the next index
- 360 by observers (whole °F or °C, or 1/2°C) may result in bias (Figure 11).



Figure 11. Frequency of decimal fractions (left axis), and average frequency (right axis) show post office data were observed mainly in whole and ½°F, and that precision improved step-wise: on moving from the PO to the Aeradio office in 1950, following metrication on 1 September 1972, which coincided with commencement of the overlap, and, following the AWS becoming the primary instrument on 1 November 1996.

370 Suggestive of a change in protocols or observers, whole and ½°F was over-represented (>c. 60%)

- at the expense of other fractions from about 1957 to the end of the overlap in 1975; however, the reason for the change is obscure.
- 373 **1.3 Site changes affect temperature extremes**

Tmax temperatures near the tails of data distributions are daily values/yr <5th and >95th day-of-year dataset percentiles (Lo and Hi extremes respectively). Extremes are expected to vary with rainfall, thus their Hi//Lo ratio is expected to be homogeneous and show no trend.

Read on ...

- As rainfall is causal on Tmax and shows no trend, counts (N) per year of daily temperatures less
- 375 than the 5th and exceeding the 95th day-of-year (1 to 366) dataset percentiles (Lo and Hi extremes
- 376 respectively) are expected to vary randomly in the long-term, while their ratio (Hi_N/Lo_N) is
- 377 expected to be homogeneous and show no trend. However, as ratios are not symmetrical (i.e., not
- 378 normally distributed) about their mean, they were log₁₀-transformed prior to analysis using STARS.
- 379 STARS analysis shows that while the move alleged by ACORN-SAT corresponded with the end of
- 380 the overlap, data from 1946 to 1975 were likely affected by shade or watering, initially at the post
- 381 office and after 1950 at the airport (Figure 12). Noting that time-wise error is not estimated by
- 382 STARS, and that rainfall from 1996 to 2005 ranked generally within the upper quartile (i.e., that
- 383 background conditions were relatively mild), the up-step in 2005 most likely had its origins in the

change from a 230-litre to a 60-litre Stevenson screen in 1996, and replacement of the Milos AWS
 with the Almos in 1998.



Figure 12. Counts/year of daily Tmax < 5^{th} and >95th dayof-year percentiles and their log₁₀-transformed ratio tracks the tails of daily data distributions. Step-changes in 1946 and 1976 are directly attributable to site changes. As the abrupt up-step in 2005 followed a period of relatively mild conditions from 1996, it was likely related to the change to the 60-litre screen and AWS in 1996.

2. Homogenisation of maximum temperature data

Homogenisation is compromised by correcting for site changes that made no difference while ignoring some that did, and making adjustments to data that are disproportionate to individual site change effects. Read on ...

396 Simon Torok (1996) merged data for Peak Hill, some 100 km north of Meekatharra with post office 397 and airport data to derive a dataset spanning from 1910 to 1993. As he made no adjustments after 398 1946, changes at the airport that impacted on data were assumed to reflect the climate. Torok's 399 adjustment file shows Tmax at Peak Hill was on average 0.1°C cooler than at the post office, and 400 inexplicably, that post office data were on-average 0.6°C cooler from 1927 to 1933 and 1.1°C 401 cooler from 1934 to 1946 than at the airport. Adjusting for those differences, but not changes at 402 the airport including the 1970s move to the MO, resulted in a homogenised Tmax trend of 403 0.06°C/decade to 1993 (Figure 13).

404 Adopting the same datasets and adjustments, Torok's HQ₁ dataset was updated to HQ₂ to 2012 by 405 Della-Marta et al. (2004). While trend increased slightly (0.06 to 0.11°C/decade) the additional 19-406 years of data improved significance of the trend coefficient from P = 0.06 for HQ₁ to P < 0.001 for

407 HQ₂.



Figure 13. Raw data for Peak Hill (ID 7070), Meekatharra post office (PO) and airport (AP) abutted to form a continuous series, and adjustments applied by Simon Torok (horizontal lines) to create the original High-Quality homogenised HQ₁ series. Adjustments prior to 1946 combined with ignoring the move in *about* 1975 resulted in a Tmax trend of 0.06°C/decade. Della-Marta et al. (2004) adopted the same changes and extended HQ₁ by 19-years to derive HQ₂. They likewise made no adjustment for the alleged move in 1975 and ignored potential effects of the small screen (smsc), and the AWS becoming the primary instrument (pi) in 1996.

However, as trend to 2012 was due to ignoring that the site moved in the 1970s, that the former
230-litre screen was replaced with a 60-litre one and the AWS became the primary instrument in
1996, it was unrelated to the true climate. Further, should the 'trend' homogenised into the data
maintain its trajectory, average maximum temperature would exceed 29.5°C by 2030, which is

426 about 1.3°C warmer than in 1910. Although trend projected forward may agree with model
 427 predictions, ever-increasing daily extremes would rapidly become unrealistic.

428 While previous homogenisation iterations applied annual or monthly adjustments, Trewin's 429 ACORN-SAT methodology aimed to adjust data distributions so daily data are "more homogeneous" 430 for extremes as well as for means"¹. ACORN-SAT aimed to skew daily data so the tails of data 431 distributions closely aligned with those of reference series derived from inter-correlated 432 neighbouring sites. Changes to previous methods included that breakpoints were detected using 433 multiple tests, and that effects of site changes on extremes were adjusted by matching percentiles 434 of data distributions with those of reference series using complex methods and *transfer functions*. 435 Compared to STARS, which detects multiple step-changes in dataset means² which are verified 436 post hoc, the greater number of statistical tests used by Trewin cannot be expected to generate 437 increased confidence that change occurred (i.e., post hoc verification is more important than the 438 number of tests).

- 439 It is noteworthy that Trewin's homogenisation methods do not straightforwardly analyse
- 440 discontinuities in the tails of data distributions *vis-à-vis* Figure 12, or persistent changes in
- 441 frequency spectra (frequencies within temperature classes) and relate those to site changes as
- shown in Figure 14.



Figure 14. Frequency of daily Tmax/yr <20°C (lower curve, left axis), is the inverse of frequencies >20°C (upper graph, right axis). STARS analysis detected step-changes in 1947, related to the new building at the PO, in 1975 consistent with cessation of smoothing the transition from the Aeradio to the MO site, and in 1999 immediately after the 60-litre screen was installed and the AWS became the primary instrument.

Although daily observations/yr less than the dataset 1st quartile declined step-wise, and those >3rd 454 455 quartile increased, incremental evaluation of daily data aggregated into classes less than about 456 20°C detected few consistent change points. The average frequency of daily temperatures >37.8°C 457 (100°F) increased slightly by 1.09% of days/yr in 1969 but not significantly (P = 0.17) and due to 458 out-of-range data in 2019, from 15% to 18% of days/yr in 2003 (P = 0.011). Adjusted directly by 459 their magnitude, residuals for frequency classes shown in Figure 14, and others, showed no trend 460 or change due to unexplained factors. Adjusting for the effect of some but not all site and 461 instrument changes on tails of daily data distributions using complex methods and transfer 462 functions potentially distorts resulting homogenised datasets so averages and extremes agree with 463 models, but do not reflect the true climate.

In summary, given that that Tmax depends on rainfall, that metadata is imprecise, and that
 observational precision was not consistent, realigning data distributions relative to a reference
 series comprised of highly correlated neighbours, so extremes are homogeneous is unlikely to
 result in unbiased trends or reliable trends in extremes.

¹ See: <u>BRR-032.pdf (bom.gov.au)</u>

² See: <u>https://www.beringclimate.noaa.gov/regimes/rodionov_overview.pdf</u>

468 **2.1 Revisiting the problem of inter-correlated comparator sites**

Embedded residual cycles in first-differenced daily or average monthly data inflates the significance of Pearson's linear correlation coefficient and invalidates the test. Like linear regression, the test assumes that data-pairs are strictly independent and not affected by outliers. Furthermore, ACORN-SAT selection criteria identified comparator sites that mostly had parallel faults. The use of faulty data to correct faults in ACORN-SAT data has no statistical or scientific merit.

Read on ...

469 Compared using first-differenced data, Trewin's ACORN-SAT methods use highly intercorrelated 470 neighbouring sites for detecting breakpoints in target site data and also for making adjustments. 471 However, as Tmax cools from summer to winter, and warms from winter to summer, the first-472 difference transformation of monthly or daily data *does not* remove underlying seasonal cycles, 473 which is a prerequisite for unbiased correlation analysis. (Embedded cycles or trends inflate the 474 significance of the Pearson linear correlation coefficient and invalidates the test.) Removing 475 seasonal cycles beforehand by deducting monthly or day-of-year averages would greatly change 476 inter-site correlations and consequently the list of stations used by Trewin to create reference 477 series. In any case, the selection of highly correlated neighbours from the pool of possible

478 contenders is highly likely to identify sites having parallel faults.

479 Of the 18 sites used to homogenise the four ACORN-SAT v.2 breakpoints listed in Table 1, eight

480 were used more than once, and fewer were available going back in time. Also, the general climate

481 at Emu Creek Station, which was the furthest away towards Learmonth, and that of wheat-belt

sites such as Merredin and Kellerberrin were unlikely to be similar to Meekatharra. Of those
 selected, only Merredin and Kalgoorlie-Boulder Airport were also ACORN-SAT sites (Figure 15).



Figure 15. The radar-plot locates the 18 comparator sites listed in Table1 used to homogenise changepoints in Meekatharra Tmax. ACORN-SAT sites are highlighted; site numbers are provided for reference.

Each of the sites listed in Table 1 were analysed using BomWatch protocols to evaluate the ACORN-SAT hypothesis that comparator sites selected on the basis of inter-site correlation, would be "broadly homogeneous around the time of the potential inhomogeneity" (Trewin, 2012¹ p. 44), and that "the use of multiple reference stations provides a high level of robustness against undetected inhomogeneities at individual reference stations" (Trewin 2018², p. 12). Results are shown in Appendix 2.

All sites listed in Table 1 were affected by station moves and changes and in many cases

step-changes in Tmax ~ rainfall residuals aligned with those at Meekatharra. Variation explained
 by rainfall alone was variable and less than 0.50, and in some cases, relationships were not

¹ Techniques involved in developing the Australian Climate Observations Reference Network – Surface Air Temperature (ACORN-SAT) dataset. CAWCR Technical Report No. 049.

² The Australian Climate Observations Reference Network – Surface Air Temperature (ACORNSAT) version 2. Bureau Research Report – BRR032.

significant. Furthermore, after accounting for residual step-changes (which were all significant),
 only six of the 18 sites exceeded the threshold whereby site changes and rainfall together
 explained >50% of Tmax variation.

507 For example, of the ten sites used to homogenise for the screen change in 1996, seven were 508 affected by step-changes that occurred within 5-years of the changepoint; of those, five were 500 within 4 years and four were within 2 years

509 within 4-years and four were within 2-years.

510 Table 1. The 18 sites used by ACORN-SAT v.2 to adjust the four changepoints in Meekatharra Tmax data.

511 Un-bolded text indicates those used more than once. $R^{2}_{(1)}$ refers to the Tmax ~ rainfall base case; $R^{2}_{(2)}$

512 refers to Tmax ~ Shift + rainfall, where Shift is a categorical variable defining segments whose between

513 segment means were not the same. Superscript¹ indicates significant (P >0.05) interaction, i.e., where

514 slopes were not homogeneous. (Summarised from Appendix 2.)

| Changepoint | BoM ID | Name | Latitude | Longitude | R ² (1) | R ² (2) |
|-------------------------------|--------|----------------------------|----------|-----------|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| New screen, 2 May 1996 | 12090 | Yeelirrie | -27.2842 | 120.0931 | 0.401 | 0.560 |
| | 13012 | Wiluna | -26.5914 | 120.2258 | 0.192 | 0.423 |
| | 12022 | Cashmere Downs | -28.9700 | 119.5686 | 0.404 | 0.559 |
| | 6099 | Murchison | -26.8956 | 115.9567 | 0.091 | 0.468 |
| | 12046 | Leonora | -28.8879 | 121.3302 | 0.359 | 0.735 |
| | 12305 | Laverton Aero | -28.6133 | 122.4236 | 0.254 | 0.673 |
| | 6022 | Gascoyne Junction | -25.0544 | 115.2100 | 0.098 | 0.314 |
| | 7139 | Paynes Find | -29.2708 | 117.6836 | 0.196 | 0.441 |
| | 6072 | Emu Creek Station | -23.0314 | 115.0414 | 0.149 | 0.482 ¹ |
| | 13015 | Carnegie | -25.7964 | 122.9753 | 0.093 | 0.460 |
| | | | | | | |
| Move 25, April 1950 | 12038 | Kalgoorlie-Boulder Airport | -30.7847 | 121.4533 | 0.326 | 0.582 |
| | 8095 | Mullewa | -28.5367 | 115.5142 | 0.268 | 0.505 |
| | 10093 | Merredin Research Station | -31.4994 | 118.2242 | 0.336 | 0.420 |
| | 8025 | Carnamah | -29.6883 | 115.8857 | 0.347 | 0.485 |
| | 10073 | Kellerberrin | -31.6183 | 117.7217 | 0.735 | 0.737 |
| | | | | | | |
| Building PO, 1 January 1946 | 12074 | Southern Cross | -31.2319 | 119.3281 | 0.211 | 0.448 |
| | 12039 | Kalgoorlie Post Office | -30.75 | 121.4667 | 0.010 ^{ns} | 0.210 ^{ns} |
| | 12038 | Kalgoorlie-Boulder Airport | -30.7847 | 121.4533 | | |
| | 10093 | Merredin Research Station | -31.4994 | 118.2242 | | |
| | 8093 | Morawa | -29.2103 | 116.0089 | 0.256 | 0.432 |
| | 10073 | Kellerberrin | -31.6183 | 117.7217 | | |
| | | | | | | |
| Statistical detect, 1 January | 42074 | Courth and Current | 24 2240 | 440 2204 | | |
| 1934 | 12074 | Southern Cross | -31.2319 | 119.3281 | | |
| | 8095 | Mullewa | -28.5367 | 115.5142 | | |
| | 10093 | werredin Research Station | -31.4994 | 118.2242 | | |
| | 8093 | Morawa | -29.2103 | 116.0089 | | |
| | 10073 | Kellerberrin | -31.6183 | 117.7217 | | |

515

516 Trewin's key assumption, which underpins his ACORN-SAT methodology, that comparator sites 517 selected on the basis of inter-site correlations would be broadly homogeneous around the time

518 site changes occurred at Meekatharra is therefore not supported. Consequently, his claim that

519 comparator series comprised of multiple reference stations could provide a "high level of

- 520 *robustness against undetected inhomogeneities*" is also not true. To the contrary, use of reference
- 521 series derived from faulty data to correct faults in ACORN-SAT data has no scientific nor statistical
- 522 merit.
- 523 Notes relating to some of the sites listed in Table 1, abstracted from Simon Torok's (1996) PhD
- 524 thesis provide little encouragement that data are likely to be useful for depicting long-term
- 525 climatic trend and change (Appendix 3). In addition, site-summary metadata for sites analysed in
- 526 Appendix 2 was generally unhelpful in diagnosing inhomogeneities. For example, no site details
- 527 were available the Kalgoorlie Post Office. Also, metadata consistently overlooked when 230-litre
- 528 Stevenson screens were replaced by 60-litre ones even though across most sites including
- 529 Meekatharra, recent step-changes in Tmax-rainfall residuals were related to the changed screen
- 530 size and not the climate.

531 Discussion and conclusions

As the climate at Meekatharra and the 18 sites used to homogenise Meekatharra Tmax data has not warmed or changed, and as faulty data are routinely used to adjust faults in ACORN-SAT data, the ACORN-SAT project is deeply flawed, unscientific and should be abandoned.

Read on ...

- 532 While homogenisation is an essential prerequisite to determining unbiased trend and change, the
- 533 processes developed by Bureau scientists from Neville Nicholls to Blair Trewin, is not
- straightforward and may be manipulated to create bogus, pre-determined trends. Weaknessesidentified in the various approaches are:
- 536i.Reliance on incomplete and misleading metadata to identify or verify times when site537changes may have impacted on data;
- 538 ii. The arbitrary selection of changepoints that may or may not have made a difference;
- 539 iii. The lack of statistical control in the detection and adjustment of changepoints using
 540 correlated comparator sites whose data are not homogeneous, and the absence of *post* 541 *hoc* verification of ACORN-SAT data.
- 542 For example, all homogenisation iterations of Meekatharra Tmax adjusted for a change at the post
- office in 1934 that was not significant (apparently according to Torok, because "the screen was a
- 544 bit high"), but they also ignored the highly significant change associated with the 1970s move to 545 the MO which was smoothed using overlap data from 1972 to 1975, thus:

| Segment | Rainfall-adjusted mean Tmax | Difference (SE) (°C) | Turkey P level |
|-----------|--------------------------------|----------------------|----------------|
| 1927-1933 | 28.9°C | | |
| 1934-1946 | 29.2°C | +0.31 (0.254) | 0.733 |
| 1946-1974 | 28.5°C | | |
| 1975-1995 | 29.0°C | +0.50 (0.144) | 0.001 |
| | | | |

- 547 Adjusting for a change in 1934 that made no difference and failing to mention the overlap from
- 548 1972 to 1975 and not adjusting for it, is disingenuous in the extreme. As the files in the NAA were
- 549 Bureau files, it is clear that from Neville Nicholls to Blair Trewin, senior scientists within the Bureau
- 550 failed to undertake the site research they said they did.
- 551 (While the rainfall adjusted difference was +0.31°C, Torok adjusted pre-1934 data by +0.54°C,
- 552 ACORN-SAT v2 by +0.57°C and ACORN-SAT v.2.1 by +0.59°C.) Together with ignoring the move to

the MO, it was this, and the magnitude of some other adjustments (some of which did not align), that created the trends in homogenised data shown in the lower panel of Figure 16.



Figure 16. A composite graph showing (top panel) segments of raw Tmax associated with homogenisation iterations (HQ₁ and HQ₂ from 1910, and ACORN-SAT v.2 (Ac₂) from 1927) and in the lower panel, effect of successive iterations on homogenised data and resulting linear trends (ACORN-SAT v.2 segments are dotted and shaded red.

568 Use of confounded (Tmax + rainfall) data adds an additional layer of uncertainty to the

569 changepoint detection problem. For instance, it raises the question whether it was the site or the 570 rainfall that changed in 1934. While providing a valid initial assessment of data fitness, removing

571 the confounded rainfall signal using naïve linear regression also removes that uncertainty (contrast

572 Figure 8(b), with Figure 8(c) to (e)). For example, as much as Blair Trewin would will it to be true in

his numerous publications and appearances on *The Conversation*¹, it could not be claimed that at

574 the conclusion of the overlap from 1973, the step-change in 1976, or the change in 1996 caused by 575 the introduction of 60-litre Stevenson screens and AWS, was due to climate change and warming.

For sites where the Tmax ~ rainfall relationship is not significant, or R²_{adj} is below about 30% 576 577 (>0.30), or for MLR, R²_{adj} <0.50, either a variable is missing, or, due to low precision, lackadaisical 578 practices, poor site maintenance including broken screens or ageing thermometers, data are too 579 rough for use in detecting trend or change. While BomWatch protocols verify the outcome of step-580 change analysis using multiple linear regression (Figure 10 and Appendix 2), supported ad hoc by 581 segmented rainfall- and time-domain analysis and inspection of MLR residuals, evidence is lacking 582 that Trewin's homogenisation methods are rigorous or that outcomes are verifiable on a site-by-583 site basis, which is essential for quality assurance of ACORN-SAT.

584 It is clear that for Meekatharra and the 18 sites analysed in Appendix 3, that all datasets consist of 585 two overlaid signals: rainfall, which is deterministic on Tmax, and an underlying ambient signal 586 against which data-to-day temperatures are measured. Changes in ambience due to a site or 587 instrument change results in an additive temperature change - a step-change as distinct from a 588 trend. While transient factors such as watering may add interference, or changes in observers may 589 affect precision, it is unlikely that those factors alone could affect long-term trend in data.

590 Examining data from multiple perspectives (e.g., Figure 11 and Figure 12), and in the frequency 591 domain (Figure 14) assists diagnosing issues related to data quality. It is evident for example, that 592 increasing temperatures and temperature extremes over recent decades is attributable to 593 replacing the former 230-lite Stevenson screen with a 60-litre one in May 1996, and supplanting 594 manual observations with the more precise and sensitive Almos AWS, which became the primary 595 instrument after 1 November 1996. It cannot be ruled out that maintenance of the site and 596 Stevenson screen deteriorated as staff were withdrawn, or that a former wooden 60-litre screen

¹ <u>https://theconversation.com/profiles/blair-trewin-3692/articles</u>

- was replaced by a plastic one having smaller, more numerous louvers that restrict air-flow acrossthe temperature probe on windless hot days.
- 599 A key outcome of the research is that due to temperatures declining from summer to winter and
- 600 increasing from winter to summer first-differenced data embed a cycle which invalidates the
- Pearson linear correlation assumption that data-pairs are not co-linked by a third variable such as
- a cycle or trend. Furthermore, as shown in Appendix 2, choosing comparator datasets on that
- 603 basis likely selects sites having parallel faults. The assumption underlying ACORN-SAT that 604 comparator series comprised of multiple reference stations could provide a *"high level of*
- 605 robustness against undetected inhomogeneities" is therefore categorically disproven.
- 606 As there is no change in the climate across all the datasets examined, and faulty data are routinely 607 used to adjust faults in ACORN-SAT data, the ACORN-SAT project is deeply flawed unscientific and 608 should be abandoned.
- 609

610 Disclaimer

- 611 Rules relating to scientific conduct by members of the Australian Meteorological and
- 612 Oceanographic Society of which the Author is a member and of which Blair Trewin was President,
- 613 specifically state that "*Members involved in scientific activities should base those activities on*
- 614 sound scientific principles" and that "Plagiarism, fabrication or falsification of data, and other
- 615 *misleading behaviour are all unacceptable*" (<u>https://www.amos.org.au/about/rules-and-</u>
- 616 regulations/amos-code-of-conduct-2/).
- 617 Unethical scientific practices including the homogenisation of data to create false narratives
- 618 undermines trust and is not in the public interest. While the persons mentioned or critiqued may
- 619 be upstanding citizens, which is not in question, the problem lies with their approach to data, use
- 620 of poor data or their portrayal of data in their cited and referenceable publications as representing
- 621 facts that are unsubstantiated, statistically questionable or not true. The debate is therefore a
- 622 scientific one, not a personal one.

623 Acknowledgements

- 624 Impetus for this research arose from the creepiness, that spearheaded by WWF, and teachers they 625 should be able to trust, school children from primary school to Year 12; students at university, and
- 626 the public at large have been groomed relentlessly by BoM, CSIRO, the Australian Museum, IPCC,
- 627 the Climate Council and high-ranking professors to believe that the world is facing a tipping-point
- 628 due to global warming caused by CO_2 , which is not true.
- Dr Neville Nicholls, who commenced as a cadet meteorologist with the Bureau of Meteorology in 1970¹ and later in 1986 was a member of the World Climate Research Programme when Dr John Zillman was Australia's permanent WMO representative oversaw BoM scientist Simon Torok's PhD and (also co-supervised Blair Trewin's PhD), which underpinned much of the Bureau's subsequent homogenisation effort. A contributor to the World Economic Forum², Nicholls is currently Emeritus Professor at Monash University and he is acknowledged for stirring my interest in the dark-art of
- 635 using data homogenisation to create bogus climatic trends and changes. The damage wrought by
- elite scientists to the integrity of science in Australia, the national economy and the wellbeing and
- 637 employment prospects of future generations in the name of climate change is deplorable.

¹ <u>https://www.eoas.info/biogs/P003289b.htm</u>

² <u>https://www.weforum.org/agenda/authors/neville-nicholls</u>

- 638 Development of decimal fraction frequencies as a precision metric resulted from discussions with
- 639 Chris Gillham (<u>https://www.waclimate.net/</u>). Others who contributed ideas and discussion
- 640 included Geoffrey Sherrington, Ken Stewart (<u>https://kenskingdom.wordpress.com/</u>) and Tom
- 641 Berger (<u>http://www.elastictruth.com/</u>). David Mason-Jones is gratefully acknowledged for
- 642 providing invaluable editorial assistance.
- 643 Research includes intellectual property that is copyright (©).

644 **Preferred citation:**

- Johnston, Bill 2021. Is homogenisation of Australian temperature data any good? Part 3.
- 646 Meekatharra, Western Australia. <u>http://www.bomwatch.com.au/</u> 23 pp.
- 647
- 648 Dr Bill Johnston
- 649 11 December 2022

651 **Appendix 1.**

652 Multiple regression analysis of Tmax scenarios shown in Figure 6.

653 Initial analysis of each paired case (Cases 2 to 5) identified step-change segments whose group

654 means were the same (P >0.05). Groups amalgamated on that basis were reanalysed, with results

655 shown sequentially below. Thus, the 5 segments in Case 2, rawTmax (top panel in Figure 6),

resolved into three significantly different groups who's within-group means were the same. These

657 were reanalysed as Case 2a. ShMax_{res} refers to step-changes detected in rescaled residuals

658 (second and lower panels in Figure 6). In each case, four initial groups resolve into three. Cases 6

and 7, tests for a site move in 1975 vs. no significant effect. (While *na* refers to not available, *nd*

660 refers to not done.)

| Scenario | Rain coeff. | Number of | Pred. means | R^2_{adj} | RSE ² | AIC ³ |
|--|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|------------------|------------------|
| | (°C/100 mm) | groups | (°C)1 | | | |
| 1. Tmax ~ rainfall | -0.055 | na | na | 0.388 | 0.727 | na |
| 2. Tmax ~ ShMax + rain | -0.053 | 5 | nd | 0.683 | 0.523 | nd |
| 2a. Tmax ~ ShMax(a) + rain | -0.049 | 3 | 1: 29.0 | 0.646 | 0.553 | 162.78 |
| Contrast Gp₁ vs Gp₃: + 0.69°C | | | 2: 28.5 | | | |
| | | | 3: 29.6 | | | |
| 3. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res1} + rain | -0.061 | 4 | nd | 0.697 | 0.512 | nd |
| 3a. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res1} (a) + rain | -0.061 | 3 | 1: 29.1 | 0.694 | 0.514 | 149.04 |
| Contrast Gp ₁ vs Gp ₃ : + 0.77°C | | | 2: 28.5 | | | |
| (1946, 1980, 1996) | | | 3: 29.8 | | | |
| 4. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res2} + rain | -0.060 | 4 | nd | 0.703 | 0.507 | nd |
| 4a. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res2} (a) + rain | -0.060 | 3 | 1: 29.0 | 0.702 | 0.508 | 146.73 |
| Contrast Gp₁ vs Gp₃: + 0.78°C | | | 2: 28.5 | | | |
| (1946, 1977, 1996) | | | 3: 29.8 | | | |
| 5. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res3} + rain | -0.061 | 4 | nd | 0.717 | 0.494 | nd |
| 5a. Tmax ~ ShMax _{res3} (a) + rain | -0.062 | 3 | 1: 29.0 | 0.715 | 0.496 | 142.35 |
| Contrast Gp₁ vs Gp₃: + 0.80°C | | | 2: 28.4 | | | |
| (1946, 1972, 1996) | | | 3: 29.8 | | | |
| 6. Tmax ~ ShMax ₁₉₇₅ + rain | -0.061 | 3 | 1: 29.0 | 0.706 | 0.504 | 145.12 |
| Contrast Gp ₁ vs Gp ₃ : + 0.79°C | | | 2: 28.4 | | | |
| (1946, 1975 , 1996) | | | 3: 29.8 | | | |
| 7. Tmax ~ ShMax _{1946&1996} + rain | -0.060 | 3 | 1: 29.1 | 0.672 | 0.533 | 155.79 |
| Contrast Gp₁ vs Gp₃: + 0.69°C | | | 2: 28.6 | | | |
| (1946, 1996 only) | | | 3: 29.8 | | | |

661 662 ¹ Segment means predicted by the *emmeans* package. In all cases differences are significant.

² Residual standard error. The model accurately predicts Tmax with an error equivalent to the RSE. A small value indicates a relatively better fit.

³ Akaike information criterion (see text).

664 665

Appendix 2.

Analysis of comparator datasets used by ACORN-SAT v.2 to homogenise Meekatharra Tmax, listed in Table 1.





673 **Appendix 3**.

- 674 Screenshots of notes for sites in Table 1 mentioned in Simon Torok's PhD Thesis.
- 675

677

Kellerberrin 10073

10/1913: First correspondence

- 1910s: Observer problems.
- 06/1935: New screen after being in poor state of repair.
- 01/1939: Min problems due to reading of wrong end of thermometer.
- 05/1971: Move 30m N to better exposure.
- 11/1971: Move 6m W of PO.
- 1979-85: No moves.
- 676 10/1985: Move 500m E of PO

Merredin 10092 and 10093

Not much information but seems good quality.

08/1915: First correspondence. Entry problems.

05/1957: Move 150m SE from old site.

01/1966: Move to excellent site due to downgrading.

03/1986: Site cleared after becoming overgrown.

Kalgoorlie 12038 and 12039

1907: Thermometer shelter falling to pieces and needs replacing.

03/1913: First correspondence. Quite a few reading problems in 1910s.

05/1923: Screen poor with iron parts replacing wood.

12/1936: Screen moved 100 yards as it was enclosed by sheds.

01/1943: Move to MO.

678 11/1943: Moved slightly as building will occur.

Leonora 12046, 12158 and 12300

11/1919: First correspondence. Screen painted and fixed.

- 1934: Entry problems as observer not instructed.
- 1936: Site closed as "the readings are taken by girls".
- 1950: Move to new site which is built up and only fair.
- 03/1972: Move to new site away from buildings.
- 02/1983: Small move back towards PO.
- 1985–7: Temporary site.

Southern Cross 12074

09/1913: First correspondence.

1910s: Entry problems and poor site.

04/1923: Yard covered with pumpkins.

12/1943: New screen.

10/1961: Possible move.

680 10/1972: Move 35m WNW to rear of PO.

Laverton 12219 and 12045

- 12/1934: First correspondence.
- 05/1935: Screen poor, new one sent.
- 06/1965: Site has become cluttered and is close to tin shed and tank.
- 06/1967: Site moved to better exposure.
- 01/1969: Move to excellent site.

Wiluna 13012

⁶⁸² 11/1912: First correspondence. New min after beading in old.

- 10/1921: Screen fixed but has been facing SW.
- 12/1941: Very old screen replaced.
- 06/1944: Thermometers replaced.
- 11/1965: Screen has been moved and painted silver.
- 06/1973: No change in poor site. Vehicles park nearby.
- 09/1991: Site still cluttered so move planned

683 684

681

685